



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 8

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Thursday, March 2, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 108 Calgary and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 135 Calgary and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, presented a petition from 117 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 131 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 127 Calgary residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 640 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 235 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Nicol, Hon. Member for Lethbridge-East, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly of Alberta, to urge the Government to intervene on the parents' behalf to have the Parkland School Division No. 70 review and reconsider the decision to amalgamate the French Immersion program

Notices of Motions

Point of Privilege - Contempt

Mr. Dickson, Official Opposition House Leader, gave notice he would be raising a question of contempt following Oral Question Period on the issue of Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, being denied access to a technical briefing on Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, on March 2, 2000.

Introduction of Bills (First Reading)

Notice having been given:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Stelmach, Minister of Infrastructure:

Report entitled “2000/01 - 2002/03 Primary Highway Construction, Primary Highway Rehabilitation, North/South Trade Corridor”, prepared by Alberta Infrastructure

Sessional Paper 134/2000

Report entitled “2000/01 - 2001/02 Secondary Highway Construction and Rehabilitation, Construction of Public Roads and Bridges”, prepared by Alberta Infrastructure

Sessional Paper 134A/2000

Copies of the proposed 2000-2001 Estimate for Seniors’ Lodges, Health Care Facilities and Water Management Infrastructure

Sessional Paper 134B/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter dated November 29, 1999, from André Morin to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the proposal to expand private health care services

Sessional Paper 135/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter dated December 6, 1999, from Dorothy Barclay to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding the proposal to allow overnight stays in private hospitals

Sessional Paper 136/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated February 8, 2000, from Beth Cook, Chairperson, on behalf of Sakaw Parent Council, to Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, regarding education funding in Alberta

Sessional Paper 137/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated December 25, 1999, from Roland Teape, M.A., to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding support for establishing more parks and wilderness areas in Alberta's foothills in relation to the Special Places 2000 Program

Sessional Paper 138/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Document entitled "Petition to the Alberta Energy and Utilities Board" from Alberta residents regarding the Torex Resources Inc. proposed gas well in the Blackfoot/Cooking Lake Recreation Area

Sessional Paper 139/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Letter dated March 2, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, to Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, regarding an offer to attend a technical briefing on the details of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 140/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Document dated September 1997, entitled "The Technology-augmented Court Record" prepared for the National Center for State Courts, Fifth National Court Technology Conference (CTC5)

Sessional Paper 141/2000

Document dated March 4, 1992, entitled "Making the Record-Court Reporting and Technology, an Analysis of the Issues" prepared by the Justice Research Institute

Sessional Paper 142/2000

Document entitled "Depositions Accuracy" prepared by the Justice Research Institute

Sessional Paper 143/2000

Document entitled "Digital Audio Recording, Information on Suitability for Use in Court" prepared by LegalVoice, Inc.

Sessional Paper 144/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter dated October 13, 1999, from Wendy Adams to Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, regarding participation in discussions on Bill 15, Natural Heritage Act, 1999

Sessional Paper 145/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Book entitled "Clear Answers: The Economics and Politics of For-Profit Medicine" by Kevin Taft and Gillian Stewart

Sessional Paper 146/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

4 letters from Albertans to Hon. Dr. Taylor, Minister of Innovation and Science, Mr. Doerksen, Hon. Member for Red Deer-South, Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie and Hon. Mr. Smith, Minister of Gaming, expressing concern about the state of funding for the Arts in Alberta

Sessional Paper 147/2000

Articles entitled "Women and Education", "Women in Science and Technology" and "Immigrants and Refugee Women" published in the Winter 1998 (Volume 17, Number 4) issue of the Canadian Woman Studies, les cahiers de la femme publication, York University

Sessional Paper 148/2000

50 cards signed by Albertans and collected by the "Edmonton Raging Grannies" regarding the provincial health care system

Sessional Paper 149/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

2 letters dated December 3, 1999 and November 29, 1999, from Valerie Braiden and Cindy Milton to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the privatization of Alberta health care

Sessional Paper 150/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated February 14, 2000, from William and Cathy Reid and family of Cochrane to Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, regarding private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 151/2000

Letter dated January 21, 2000, from Jim Cuhier of Lethbridge to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding private health care in Alberta

Sessional Paper 152/2000

Comments dated January 16, 2000, from C. H. Dyke of Calgary in response to the Alberta Policy Statement on Health Principles and the Policy Statement on Surgical Services, dated November 17, 1999

Sessional Paper 153/2000

Letter dated January 12, 2000, from Lou and Colleen Lindblad of Calgary to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the proposed private health care bill

Sessional Paper 154/2000

Letter dated December 3, 1999, from Doug and Janet Friebel of Lethbridge to Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands, regarding private for-profit hospitals in Alberta

Sessional Paper 155/2000

Letter dated December 15, 1999, from Joan Bowes of Sherwood Park to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding privatization of the health care system

Sessional Paper 156/2000

Letter dated December 13, 1999, from Mary Trumpener of Edmonton to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding private for-profit hospitals in Alberta

Sessional Paper 157/2000

Letter dated November 18, 1999, from Joanne B. Clelland of Edmonton to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding private hospital services in Alberta

Sessional Paper 158/2000

Letter dated December 18, 1999, from Thea Paap of Edmonton to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding contracting out specific services to private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 159/2000

Letter dated December 21, 1999, from Terry Dashcavich, BA, MA, Med., of Peace River to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding privatized health care

Sessional Paper 160/2000

Letter dated January 4, 2000, from Evelyn Henderson of Edmonton to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding privatization of health care

Sessional Paper 161/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated March 2, 2000, from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) and cataract surgery

Sessional Paper 162/2000

Letter from Floyd Haynes to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual arrangements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 163/2000

Letter from Floyd Haynes to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding the proposal to allow Regional Health Authorities to enter into contractual arrangements with private for-profit hospitals

Sessional Paper 164/2000

Document dated March 2000 entitled "The Privatization and the Commercialization of Public Hospital Based Medical Services Within the Province of Alberta - An Economic Overview From a Public Interest Perspective", by Richard Plain, PhD Econ, Department of Economics, University of Alberta, Medicare Economics Group, with attached executive summary

Sessional Paper 165/2000

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

Letter dated February 29, 2000, from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, regarding the twelve principles of the Alberta approach to health care

Sessional Paper 166/2000

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

Letter dated February 29, 2000, from Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, to Hon. Allan Rock, Minister of Health, House of Commons, regarding the twelve principles of the Alberta approach to health care

Sessional Paper 167/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

Letter dated February 8, 2000, from Joe Turnham to Ms. A. Trimbee, Director of Environmental Assessment, Department of Environment, regarding the Genesis Land Development's plan to develop the Spray Valley as a recreational area

Sessional Paper 168/2000

E-mail dated February 12, 2000, from several Albertans to Mr. Gobi Singh, Chief Executive Officer, Genesis Land Development, regarding the Genesis proposal to develop major recreational facilities in the Spray Valley

Sessional Paper 169/2000

Letter dated February 9, 2000, from Pauline A. Williams to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the Genesis Land Development's proposal to develop the Spray Lake's Four Season Resort and the Mount Sparrowhawk Heli-Cat Ski Operation

Sessional Paper 170/2000

Members' Statements

Mr. Renner, Hon. Member for Medicine Hat, made a statement regarding an announcement by the Palliser Regional Health Authority's acquisition and operation of a Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) unit at the Medicine Hat regional hospital.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, made a statement about the variety of Albertans fighting to preserve the high-quality, public health care system in Alberta.

Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, made a statement regarding the grand openings of the innovative Carewest Signal Point Alzheimer's Centre and the Family Care Giver Centre in Calgary and the innovative partnerships in health care.

Projected Government Business

Pursuant to Standing Order 7(5), Mr. Dickson, Official Opposition House Leader, asked a question pertaining to the order of Government Business to be brought before the Assembly for the following week.

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, gave notice of projected Government Business for the week of March 6 to March 10, 2000:

Monday, March 6	Aft.	- Government Bills and Orders Second Reading Bill 12, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 Government Motions Spring, Easter and Sessional Adjournment Motions (No. 5, 6 and 7) And as per Order Paper
	Eve.	- Government Bills and Orders Committee of Supply Main Estimates Days 6 and 7 Subcommittees (A) Treasury (Assembly) (Day 6, Main Estimates) (B) Justice and Attorney General (Room 512, Legislature Building) (Day 7, Main Estimates)

			<p>Address in Reply to the Speech from the Throne</p> <p>Second Reading or Committee of the Whole</p> <p>Bill 12</p> <p>And as per Order Paper</p>
Tuesday, March 7	(4:30)	-	<p>Government Bills and Orders</p> <p>Government Motions</p> <p>Spring, Easter and Sessional Adjournment Motions (No. 5, 6 and 7)</p> <p>And as per Order Paper</p>
	Eve.	-	<p>Government Bills and Orders</p> <p>Committee of Supply</p> <p>Main Estimates Days 8 and 9</p> <p>Subcommittees</p> <p>(C) Agriculture, Food and Rural Development (Assembly) (Day 9, Main Estimates)</p> <p>(D) Innovation and Science (Room 512, Legislature Building) (Day 8, Main Estimates)</p> <p>Committee of the Whole</p> <p>Bill 12</p> <p>And as per Order Paper</p>
Wednesday, March 8	Eve.	-	<p>Government Bills and Orders</p> <p>Committee of Supply</p> <p>Main Estimates Days 10 and 11</p>

Subcommittees

(A) Executive Council
(Assembly)
(Day 10, Main Estimates)

(B) Infrastructure (Room 512,
Legislature Building)
(Day 11, Main Estimates)

Third Reading

Bill 12

And as per Order Paper

Thursday, March 9

Aft. - **Government Bills and Orders**

Committee of Supply

Official Opposition Designation
for Thursday
(Day 12, Main Estimates)

And as per Order Paper

Point of Privilege - Contempt

Mr. Dickson raised a purported Point of Privilege and Contempt of the House under Standing Order 15 regarding the exclusion of the Leader of the Opposition from a technical briefing on Bill 11, the Health Protection Act, and the provision of information in the briefing to individuals not Members of the Assembly prior to the introduction of the Bill.

Hon. Mr. Hancock responded to the Point of Privilege-Contempt.

Mr. Dickson indicated he would be providing further information on the issue.

The Speaker commented that he would consider further information on the matter at the conclusion of the Daily Routine on Monday, March 6, 2000.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Government Bills and Orders

Third Reading

The following Bill was read a Third time and passed:

Bill 9 Appropriation (Interim Supply) Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

Committee of Supply (Day 5 — Main Estimates)

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mrs. O'Neill reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of Executive Council for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001, reports progress thereon, and requests leave to sit again.

Mr. Speaker, I would like to table copies of a document tabled by Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, during Committee of Supply consideration of the Estimates of Executive Council:

Newspaper article entitled "Enough Whining, Appreciate Alberta"
Sessional Paper 171/2000

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:27 p.m. until Monday, March 6, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Thursday, March 2, 2000